**Unconscious Bias – Analysis Plan: Key tables of Results from Analysis of Primary Outcomes**

Table 1: Gender Bias – Selection of Potentially Suitable Applicants:

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **De-identified Group** | | **Control Group 1** | | **Control Group 2** | | **Average effects:**  **Percentage point differences ( *p* values\*)** | | |
| **Number** | **%** | **Name** | **%** | **Name** | **%** | **A.**  **De-identified**  **Vs. Male** | **B.**  **De-identified**  **Vs. Female** | **C.**  **Male**  **Vs. Female** |
| 1 |  | Cassie Higgins |  | Rod Higgins |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  | Tony Langford |  | Carla Langford |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  | Sita Singh |  | Sanjay Singh |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  | Claire O’Toole |  | Rhys O’Toole |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  | Lisa Kent |  | Mark Kent |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  | Jake Lewis |  | Lucy Lewis |  |  |  |  |
| 7 |  | Ahmed Saqqaf |  | Fatima Saqqaf |  |  |  |  |
| 8 |  | Chang (Lawrence) Chen |  | Wei (Lulu) Chen |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  | Natasha Mitchell |  | Brett Mitchell |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  | Skye Elliot |  | Joel Elliot |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  | Andrew Brennan |  | Lauren Brennan |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  | Geoffrey McIntyre |  | Emily McIntyre |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  | Kylie Brown |  | Steven Brown |  |  |  |  |
| 14 |  | Tegan Skinner |  | Craig Skinner |  |  |  |  |
| 15 |  | Gary Richards |  | Wendy Richards |  |  |  |  |
| 16 |  | George Johnson |  | Tamara Johnson |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  | **D.**  **AVERAGE EFFECTS**  **(all applicants)** | |  |  |  |

\* Note: *p* values are based on estimations (see Table x, below) for each applicant in which the outcome is regressed on an indicator for when an applicant was identified as male (A) vs. de-identified, or female (B) vs. de-identified, in a control group; *p* values in C. are based on estimations for each applicant in which the outcome is regressed on an indicator for when an applicant was identified as male vs. female in the control groups. For D. *p* values are based on estimations (as for A-C) for all applicants.

Table 2: Gender Bias – Selection of the Shortlist:

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **De-identified Group** | | **Control Group 1** | | **Control Group 2** | | **Average effects:**  **Percentage point differences ( *p* values\*)** | | |
| **Number** | **%** | **Name** | **%** | **Name** | **%** | **A.**  **De-identified**  **Vs. Male** | **B.**  **De-identified**  **Vs. Female** | **C.**  **Male**  **Vs. Female** |
| 1 |  | Cassie Higgins |  | Rod Higgins |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  | Tony Langford |  | Carla Langford |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  | Sita Singh |  | Sanjay Singh |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  | Claire O’Toole |  | Rhys O’Toole |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  | Lisa Kent |  | Mark Kent |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  | Jake Lewis |  | Lucy Lewis |  |  |  |  |
| 7 |  | Ahmed Saqqaf |  | Fatima Saqqaf |  |  |  |  |
| 8 |  | Chang (Lawrence) Chen |  | Wei (Lulu) Chen |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  | Natasha Mitchell |  | Brett Mitchell |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  | Skye Elliot |  | Joel Elliot |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  | Andrew Brennan |  | Lauren Brennan |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  | Geoffrey McIntyre |  | Emily McIntyre |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  | Kylie Brown |  | Steven Brown |  |  |  |  |
| 14 |  | Tegan Skinner |  | Craig Skinner |  |  |  |  |
| 15 |  | Gary Richards |  | Wendy Richards |  |  |  |  |
| 16 |  | George Johnson |  | Tamara Johnson |  |  |  |  |
|  | | | | **D.**  **AVERAGE EFFECTS**  **(all applicants)** | |  |  |  |

\* Note: *p* values are based on estimations (see Table x, below) for each applicant in which the outcome is regressed on an indicator for when an applicant was identified as male (A) vs. de-identified, or female (B) vs. de-identified, in a control group; *p* values in C. are based on estimations for each applicant in which the outcome is regressed on an indicator for when an applicant was identified as male vs. female in the control groups. For D. *p* values are based on estimations (as for A-C) for all applicants.

Table 3: Gender Bias – Average Scores Assigned (potentially suitable applicants):

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **De-identified Group** | | **Control Group 1** | | **Control Group 2** | | **Average effects:**  **Score differences ( *p* values\*)** | | |
| **Number** | **Avg** | **Name** | **Avg** | **Name** | **Avg** | **A.**  **De-identified**  **Vs. Male** | **B.**  **De-identified**  **Vs. Female** | **C.**  **Male**  **Vs. Female** |
| 1 |  | Cassie Higgins |  | Rod Higgins |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  | Tony Langford |  | Carla Langford |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  | Sita Singh |  | Sanjay Singh |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  | Claire O’Toole |  | Rhys O’Toole |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  | Lisa Kent |  | Mark Kent |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  | Jake Lewis |  | Lucy Lewis |  |  |  |  |
| 7 |  | Ahmed Saqqaf |  | Fatima Saqqaf |  |  |  |  |
| 8 |  | Chang (Lawrence) Chen |  | Wei (Lulu) Chen |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  | Natasha Mitchell |  | Brett Mitchell |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  | Skye Elliot |  | Joel Elliot |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  | Andrew Brennan |  | Lauren Brennan |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  | Geoffrey McIntyre |  | Emily McIntyre |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  | Kylie Brown |  | Steven Brown |  |  |  |  |
| 14 |  | Tegan Skinner |  | Craig Skinner |  |  |  |  |
| 15 |  | Gary Richards |  | Wendy Richards |  |  |  |  |
| 16 |  | George Johnson |  | Tamara Johnson |  |  |  |  |
|  | | | | **D. AVERAGE EFFECTS**  **(all applicants)** | |  |  |  |

\* Note: *p* values are based on estimations (see Table x, below) for each applicant in which the outcome is regressed on an indicator for when an applicant was identified as male (A) vs. de-identified, or female (B) vs. de-identified, in a control group; *p* values in C. are based on estimations for each applicant in which the outcome is regressed on an indicator for when an applicant was identified as male vs. female in the control groups. For D. *p* values are based on estimations (as for A-C) for all applicants.

Table 4: Ethnicity Bias – Selection of Potentially Suitable Applicants:

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **De-identified Group** | | **Ethnicity**  **(named)** | **Control Group 1** | | **Control Group 2** | | **Average effects:**  **Percentage point differences ( *p* values\*)** | | |
| **No.** | **%** |  | **Name** | **%** | **Name** | **%** | **A.**  **De-identified**  **Vs. Male** | **B.**  **De-identified**  **Vs. Female** | **C.**  **De-identified**  **Vs. Named** |
| 3 |  | Indian | Sita Singh |  | Sanjay Singh |  |  |  |  |
| 7 |  | Pakistani | Ahmed Saqqaf |  | Fatima Saqqaf |  |  |  |  |
| 8 |  | Chinese | Chang (Lawrence) Chen |  | Wei (Lulu) Chen |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  | Indigenous^ | Skye Elliot |  | Joel Elliot |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  | **D. Minority names** | |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  | **E. Anglo-Celtic names** | |  |  |  |

\* Note: *p* values are based on estimations (see Table x, below) for each applicant in which the outcome is regressed on an indicator for when an applicant was identified as male (A) vs. de-identified, or female (B) vs. de-identified, in a control group; *p* values in C. are based on estimations for each applicant in which the outcome is regressed on an indicator for when an applicant was identified by name (male or female) in the control groups. For D. *p* values are based on estimations (as for A-C) for all applicants.

^ Indigeneity is identified by a check mark indicating the applicant answered “yes” in response to the question “Do you identify as Aboriginal or Torres Strait Islander?” in the section of the application materials listing personal details.

Table 5: Ethnicity Bias – Selection of the Shortlist:

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **De-identified Group** | | **Ethnicity**  **(named)** | **Control Group 1** | | **Control Group 2** | | **Average effects:**  **Percentage point differences ( *p* values\*)** | | |
| **No.** | **%** |  | **Name** | **%** | **Name** | **%** | **A.**  **De-identified**  **Vs. Male** | **B.**  **De-identified**  **Vs. Female** | **C.**  **De-identified**  **Vs. Named** |
| 3 |  | Indian | Sita Singh |  | Sanjay Singh |  |  |  |  |
| 7 |  | Pakistani | Ahmed Saqqaf |  | Fatima Saqqaf |  |  |  |  |
| 8 |  | Chinese | Chang (Lawrence) Chen |  | Wei (Lulu) Chen |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  | Indigenous^ | Skye Elliot |  | Joel Elliot |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  | **D. Minority names** | |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  | **E. Anglo-Celtic names** | |  |  |  |

\* Note: *p* values are based on estimations (see Table x, below) for each applicant in which the outcome is regressed on an indicator for when an applicant was identified as male (A) vs. de-identified, or female (B) vs. de-identified, in a control group; *p* values in C. are based on estimations for each applicant in which the outcome is regressed on an indicator for when an applicant was identified by name (male or female) in the control groups. For D. *p* values are based on estimations (as for A-C) for all applicants.

^ Indigeneity is identified by a check mark indicating the applicant answered “yes” in response to the question “Do you identify as Aboriginal or Torres Strait Islander?” in the section of the application materials listing personal details.

Table 6: Ethnicity Bias – Average Scores Assigned (potentially suitable applicants):

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **De-identified Group** | | **Ethnicity**  **(named)** | **Control Group 1** | | **Control Group 2** | | **Average effects:**  **Score differences ( *p* values\*)** | | |
| **No.** | **Avg** |  | **Name** | **Avg** | **Name** | **Avg** | **A.**  **De-identified**  **Vs. Male** | **B.**  **De-identified**  **Vs. Female** | **C.**  **De-identified**  **Vs. Named** |
| 3 |  | Indian | Sita Singh |  | Sanjay Singh |  |  |  |  |
| 7 |  | Pakistani | Ahmed Saqqaf |  | Fatima Saqqaf |  |  |  |  |
| 8 |  | Chinese | Chang (Lawrence) Chen |  | Wei (Lulu) Chen |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  | Indigenous^ | Skye Elliot |  | Joel Elliot |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  | **D. Minority names** | |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  | **E. Anglo-Celtic names** | |  |  |  |

\* Note: *p* values are based on estimations (see Table x, below) for each applicant in which the outcome is regressed on an indicator for when an applicant was identified as male (A) vs. de-identified, or female (B) vs. de-identified, in a control group; *p* values in C. are based on estimations for each applicant in which the outcome is regressed on an indicator for when an applicant was identified by name (male or female) in the control groups. For D. *p* values are based on estimations (as for A-C) for all applicants.

^ Indigeneity is identified by a check mark indicating the applicant answered “yes” in response to the question “Do you identify as Aboriginal or Torres Strait Islander?” in the section of the application materials listing personal details.

Table 7: Gender Bias – Subgroup Analysis for Selection to Shortlist:

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | **Average effects:**  **Percentage point differences ( *p* values\*)** | | |
|  | **Reviewer Sub-Groups** | **A.**  **De-identified**  **Vs. Male** | **B.**  **De-identified**  **Vs. Female** | **C.**  **Male**  **Vs. Female** |
| **Gender:** | Females |  |  |  |
| Males |  |  |  |
| **Age:** | Under 40 |  |  |  |
| 40 and older |  |  |  |
| **Agency:** | ATO |  |  |  |
| Agriculture |  |  |  |
| DSS |  |  |  |
| Defence |  |  |  |
| Environment |  |  |  |
| Health |  |  |  |
| Employment |  |  |  |
| PM&C |  |  |  |
| Treasury |  |  |  |
| Industry |  |  |  |
| AGD |  |  |  |
| Small agencies |  |  |  |
|  | **D. AVERAGE EFEFCTS**  **(all reviewers)** |  |  |  |

\* Note: *p* values are based on estimations (see Table x, below) for all applicants in which the outcome is regressed on an indicator for when an applicant was identified as male (A) vs. de-identified, or female (B) vs. de-identified, in a control group;, or an indicator for when an applicant was identified as male vs. female (C) in the control groups, for specific sub-groups of reviewers (and all reviewers, D.).

Table 8: Ethnicity Bias – Subgroup Analysis for Selection to Shortlist:

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | **MINORITY NAMES**  **Average effects:**  **Percentage point differences ( *p* values\*)** | | |
|  | **Reviewer Sub-Groups** | **A.**  **De-identified**  **Vs. Male** | **B.**  **De-identified**  **Vs. Female** | **C.**  **De-identified**  **Vs. Named** |
| **Gender:** | Females |  |  |  |
| Males |  |  |  |
| **Age:** | Under 40 |  |  |  |
| 40 and older |  |  |  |
| **Agency:** | ATO |  |  |  |
| Agriculture |  |  |  |
| DSS |  |  |  |
| Defence |  |  |  |
| Environment |  |  |  |
| Health |  |  |  |
| Employment |  |  |  |
| PM&C |  |  |  |
| Treasury |  |  |  |
| Industry |  |  |  |
| AGD |  |  |  |
| Small agencies |  |  |  |
|  | **D. AVERAGE EFEFCTS**  **(all reviewers)** |  |  |  |

\* Note: *p* values are based on estimations (see Table x, below) for all minority applicants in which the outcome is regressed on an indicator for when an applicant was identified as male (A) vs. de-identified, or female (B) vs. de-identified, in a control group;, or an indicator for when an applicant was identified by name (male or female) in the control groups (C), for specific sub-groups of reviewers (and all reviewers, D.).